(1) Defining linguistic areas
   a. A geographic area
   b. Shared structural feature(s) due to contact/borrowing
   c. More than one such feature/isogloss
   d. Two or more languages
   e. Multiple language families
      › I think these may have been intended as diagnostics, not definitions, e.g. the last.

(2) Campbell’s questions
   a. Number of languages? — only two required
   b. Number of traits? — lower limits are arbitrary
   c. Isoglosses vs. core/periphery? — core is messier but justified
   d. Are there different kinds of ‘linguistic area’? — yes
   e. Geography vs. vertical or same-location contact? — all of the above
   f. Inheritance vs. diffusion? — both, but inheritance has primacy (c.f. Dench 2001)

(3) Is there a clearcut difference between borrowing and areal linguistics?
   • “A linguistic area, to the extent that it may have a legitimate existence at all, is merely the sum of borrowings in individual languages in contact situations.” (13)

   Table 1: The two types of contact (Thomason & Kaufman 1988; Van Coetsem 1995)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of contact</th>
<th>Maintenance</th>
<th>Language shift</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Type of change</td>
<td>Borrowing</td>
<td>Imposition/substratum change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recipient language</td>
<td>Into dominant language or L1</td>
<td>Into non-dominant language or L2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More transfer of</td>
<td>(Less stable) lexical items …</td>
<td>(More stable) phonology …</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

› I agree that it’s heavy borrowing. i.e. I’d expect loanwords as well as structural features.
› Hence I wouldn’t even try to draw a clear line between dialect contact and language areas.
› But I don’t think we can say that linguistic areas don’t exist, just because they’re a type of borrowing. When human communities group into larger units, that could potentially be different in nature from one-on-one contact. We agreed that the real question was whether different changes are observed in linguistic areas compared to borrowing.

References

